1. **Call to Order:** The regular meeting of the Council of Trustees was called to order at 4:08 p.m. by Chair Pat Ross.

2. **Roll Call:** Completed by the Recording Secretary Marcy L. Cetnar, the following members were present:

   - Mr. Edward Abraham
   - Dr. Vincent DeFranco
   - Ms. Josephine Ferro
   - Ms. Rebecca Keck
   - Mr. Bruno Klaus
   - Mr. Harry Lee
   - Mr. Marcus Lingenfelter
   - Ms. Nancy Perretta
   - Mr. Pat Ross
   - Hon. Mario Scavello
   - Ms. Amy Welch

   Chair Ross welcomed Ms. Josephine Ferro, our new Council member to her first meeting. Chair Ross also welcomed the students attending today’s meeting and thanked them for choosing ESU.

   Chair Ross then announced the change of order of today’s Agenda which will be as follows; President’s Report, Approval of minutes, Committee Reports, Chair’s Report, Secretary’s Report, Old Business, New Business, Public Comments, Executive Session, and Adjournment.

3. **President’s Report:** President Welsh reported on the Yvonne Troiani Sweeney Endowed Lecture Series for Nursing Enrichment featuring H. Branch Coslett, M.D. The Lecture is taking place on Thursday, March 13 at 5pm in room 336 of the Innovation Center, followed by a reception in room 334. The lecture is sponsored by the Niedbala Family Foundation. Local hospitals, healthcare centers, faculty from other universities have been invited to this event along with the campus community. President Welsh acknowledged the talented students at ESU which over 500 are involved in athletics. It has been a good year for most of the teams, but especially for basketball. Both men’s and women’s basketball teams are in the conference championships but the men’s is the PSAC East Conference Champions with a 25-1 win/loss record. ESU will be hosting the PSAC Championships and encouraged everyone to show their school spirit. Last evening she had the privilege to honor seven seniors for athletics and academic achievements. President Welsh also reported on the many exciting events occurring in the final months of the spring semester including many band and coral concerts, dance recitals, award programs, and theatre performances. The theatre department will be presenting the Wizard of Oz and is partnering with Liztech on the Wizard of Oz series and ½ of the proceeds of sales will go to the Theatre Department to help with scholarships.

   Regarding the progress with retrenchment, earlier this week the Chemistry department presented us a plan that addresses many of our concerns, including learning outcomes, staffing, and program quality. We are committed to ensuring all students currently in the chemistry department as majors as well as those students in majors served by the Department of Chemistry do have the courses they need in a sequence that will allow them to graduate on time. There has been much misinformation given to students and their families, but we are committed to high quality academic programs and honesty with our students. We are in conversation with ACS regarding best practices and their concern with our current curriculum and ACS certification and how we can better serve our students, and have all Chemistry programs ACS certified.

   We are in conversation with the PA State Board of Nursing regarding a modernization of how we teach chemistry to nursing as well as to other students in the health sciences, resulting in cost savings and improved student learning, meeting the needs of all health science majors.

   Regarding the retrenchments in Counseling, we have been working with the Counseling Center to find efficiencies and, assuming we can successfully merge the center with Disability Support Services, we have been presented with over $150K in savings that will allow us to rescind the retrenchment letter of the one individual in the Center.
4. **Approval of Minutes:** Trustee Scavello made a motion to approve the minutes from the December 5, 2013 meeting; Trustee Lee seconded; no abstentions. The motion carried.

5. **Chair’s Report:** None

6. **Secretary’s Report:** None

7. **Committee Reports**
   A. **Administration & Finance:** (Trustee Lee)

   (1) The committee reviewed the Cash Disbursement Reports for November and December 2013. **Trustee Abraham** made a motion to approve the cash disbursement journals for November and December 2013; Trustee Perretta seconded, no abstentions. The motion carried.

   (2) The committee reviewed Act 57 Purchase Report for 11/16/13 through 01/31/14. **Trustee Ferro** made a motion to approve the Act 57 Purchase Report for 11/16/13 through 01/31/14; Trustee Scavello seconded, no abstentions. The motion carried.

   (3) **Course Specific Instructional fee for high cost / high demand Undergraduate Programs – Student Fee Pilot Program.** Dr. Welsh explained the pilot fee program for the Nursing program which was approved by the Board of Governors and now needs to be approved at the local level. The fees only apply to the clinical portion of the training.

   Trustee Scavello asked how ESU compares in the Nursing program fees? President Welsh indicated that all other private university nursing tuitions are considerably higher. Our cost of tuition is about 30% of private institutions in the region. Despite the increase, which is done to save the program, still leaves the overall cost lower.

   **Trustee Scavello** made a motion to approve the Student Fee Pilot Program; Trustee Klaus seconded, no abstentions. The motion carried.

   (4) Local Fees for 2014-2015. The mandatory fees of $1007 this year will increase $44 to $1051 for next year. **Trustee Scavello** made a motion to approve the Local Fees for 2014-2015; Trustee Perretta seconded, no abstentions. The motion carried.

   (5) **Project Status Review:** The Committee reviewed the Project Status Review. All questions and concerns were answered satisfactorily.


   (7) Vice President Ken Long provided an update of the 2014-2015 Budget and is currently working on providing various analyses. There will be a preliminary draft of the budget at the April board meeting. Revenue rose at a 2% rate annually with a 3% tuition increase, expense growth is between 5-6% primarily based on salaries, and health care growing at 7% annually. Retirement costs are increasing approximately 20%. A structural deficit of 3% which we need to resolve. Carried over $3.2 million from last year.

   Trustee Ross stated we cannot finalize the budget until the State Appropriations have been set by the state. VP Long confirmed that yes that is correct.

   (8) ESU’s Proposal for Differential Undergraduate Non-Resident Tuition beginning Fall, 2014. This was on the January 2014 Board of Governor’s Agenda for action.
Trustee Lee discussed the analysis report of the budget that was completed by Boyer & Ritter as requested by the faculty. VP Long reported on the analysis. The report was issued 10/25/13 and ESU received the report the 1st week of December. The Chancellor’s Office did an analysis of the report and several of the other PASSHE Universities did an analysis as well including ESU. There were several errors throughout the report and incorrect comparisons.

Trustee Lingenfelter stated in general they, Boyer & Ritter, produced a paper not following methodical accounting practices so it was mainly just a paper. VP Long agreed that yes they did not follow general accounting practices.

Trustee Lee stated that the one thing he found stunning about the Boyer & Ritter report was they were using proposed numbers one year prior to the reporting period. Doing so there were too many assumptions within the report. They should have used actual expenses. The bottom line is it was a very, very deficient report.

B. Academic Affairs & Enrollment Management: (Trustee Lingenfelter)
Trustee Lingenfelter reported that the Enrollment Management provide information showing that overall registration is only off by less than 1%. He applauded the work of the Admissions Department and the positive recruiting.

(1) Approval of University College. Trustee Lee made a motion to approve the new University College; Trustee Perretta seconded, no abstentions. The motion carried.

(2) Approval of the President’s Policy Recommendation Posthumous Degree, AA-2014-001 (revised): Trustee Scavello made a motion to approve the President’s policy recommendation; Trustee DeFranco seconded, no abstentions. The motion carried.

C. Student Affairs: (Trustee Keck)
Trustee Keck reported that Daria Wielebinski provided an informational update on Career Services initiatives and provided a handout on Advancing University Strategic Goals. The report reflected many positive changes towards the evolution of ESU’s Career Development Center for students.

Pat Baylor reported on SAA’s new initiative to help students afford books based on financial needs. SAA is working with Enrollment Services to provide immediate use of student anticipated financial aid refunds for purchase of textbooks and other academic materials. Ms. Baylor also addressed the new Barnes & Noble’s Book Scholarship Program. A partnership through SAA and Barnes & Noble’s has allocated $10,000 for this program. Both programs will help ESU with retention efforts.

Jill Harper reported on the MLK Jr. Day of Service Inaugural Program with over 50 students participating on both on and off campus initiatives.

Kwaku Adjei-Bohyen, VP of Student Senate, reported on student elections and Community on the Quad April 26th. A parking committee was formed to address parking on campus. Afia King is in the process of developing a Walk on Campus in March to raise awareness on Sexual Assault.

Trustee Keck addressed the weather conditions on campus during the recent ice and snow days. Trustee Keck wants to ensure that preventative measures will be taken in the future to keep everyone safe.

Other items of discussion included MindFest, Mock Trial, upcoming Bar Stool Blackout at the Sherman Theater and alternative programming on campus, and Title IX Clery training initiatives.
D. **Research & Economic Development: (Trustee Abraham)**

Trustee Abraham asked Vice President of Research & Economic Development Mary Frances Postupack to provide the report from the Committee meeting. VP Postupack reported that the Committee met and had presentations from companies in the Business Acceleration Program. Jonathan Morales won first place at the business competition and received $3000 and will be competing at the PASSHE level. Jonathan Weber presented on the TickCheck and Marathon Studios. David Good presented on The Good Project. Dr. Mary DeVito and Dr. Robert Marmelstein presented on the FD Software.

Sharon Glasco provided an update on the Pearson VUE Testing Center which allows student in the Education programs to take their PAPA’s at the Innovation Center. Ms. Glasco also reported on the WEDnetPA company status and allocations.

Other areas discussed included the Sponsored Projects and Research and the Entrepreneurial Leadership Center.

8. **Old Business:** Trustee Scavello wanted to thank Dr. Welsh and Chair Ross for meeting with him this morning.

9. **New Business:**

   A. **Nominating Committee for Election of Officers:** Trustee Ross indicated Trustee Scavello, Trustee Abraham, and Trustee Lee will be on the Nominating Committee.

   B. Trustee Ross shared that the 2014 Spring PACT Conference will be held in Harrisburg and stated that Trustee Lingenfelter is the President of PACT for the past three years and is doing a fantastic job. Trustee Lingenfelter shared the theme for this year’s conference “Constructive Innovation” and hopes the Trustees’ will plan to attend.


10. **Public Comments:** Trustee Ross informed the audience that those making public comments to adhere to the following rules; state your name, all comments will be kept to three minutes, a clock will be kept and a one minute remaining announcement will be made if needed, and there will be no yielding of time to other speakers.

    Naomi Meyer, a student loves the campus and faculty is amazing. She organized to have the students there and wasn’t sure of the response, congratulated all of the students that were in attendance. Ms. Meyer stated she was approached and asked if she was being approached by the faculty to do her part in organizing her outreach. She said she was not and then invited the Trustees to come as a student in the Science and Tech building to attend classes and see what the students are doing because you haven’t been in a classroom in a long time.

    Meyer continued that she wants them to see what this school is about. See what kind of professors you have. She has a learning disability and she has had professors come in early to tutor her for a quiz. These professors know you as individuals here, we aren’t numbers. Go into the classroom and hear the professors and see how extraordinary they are. She loves the embrace of the professors, you don’t get that at any of the other colleges, you get it here at ESU. She stated she is concerned about the science department and she won’t be leaving in May until she knows what is happening here and knows that everything is OK. She asked the Council to not just sit there behind their little name blocks and fancy clothing, she wants them to come to the building and see what the students are fighting about. There are a lot of students here that are sometimes lost and there are professors here making a difference.

    Christopher Powers, representing peers, presented the Council of Trustees with a petition which was circulated for three days and contained 591 signatures. This proves student awareness and concern on cuts of the STEM program with the reduction of 6 faculty members. This leaves hardly enough staff in the chemistry department to provide the necessary classes. Stated he was a junior and will not be able to complete his degree with the cuts. Biology
degrees, biochemistry, nursing, and numerous others will not be able to receive the proper classes. Students have
been told we will not feel the cuts and this is not true. President Welsh asked Christopher why does he feel he will
not be able to graduate? Christopher responded that the classes and labs will not be offered due to lab capacity.
That is what he was told. President Welsh asked him who he was getting his information from? Christopher stated
the students can see by the number of students needing classes and the number of seats available.

Provost Reidhead then addressed the audience and indicated that since the fall he has been in conversation with the
American Chemical Society and they have put him in contact with other universities across the country. This is not a
criticism of our faculty who are outstanding and yes, we do have good faculty here. We are not fortunate with the
budget times we are in and we are not alone in that. This is occurring across the country. Provost Reidhead also
stated he has been in meetings with the Chairs of both the Chemistry and the Biology departments these past few
days and also with the State Board of Nursing and is aware of what can be done and what can’t be done to get you
the best education. Chemistry, Biochemistry, Biology, Nursing, and all other programs will get the needed courses
to allow students to graduate.

Dr. Maria Kitchens-Kintz, Dr. Alan Shaffer, and Dr. Maryann Matras, representing a group called CSTEM, supporting
ESU STEM and started the group in the beginning of the semester with the budget cuts. The group meets each
month and they are finding ways to make STEM known throughout the campus. When you cut one department you
are affecting many others. Biology keeps growing and as it grows you continue to need physics, chemistry, and
mathematics and these programs will continue to grow as well. Trustee Ross wished the group luck in what they are
doing for ESU.

Essad Rameny, student, stated it was not easy listening to the rumors and cuts going on around ESU. Is there any
way to have a message board so we are made aware? President Welsh informed Essad that they are looking at ways
to reach out to the campus community, specifically students. Essad stated he was very proud of ESU and enjoys
being here and he chose ESU because College Board stated the low class size. The cuts will cause having more
students in classrooms and that will not be good for the students. Professors are amazing and are not being treated
fairly.

Victoria Paskiet, a junior in the Biochemistry program, referred to the previous student Chris and all
she wants is
security in the Chemistry and Biochemistry departments. Now that you cut these professors we might not get the
classes we need to graduate with our academic degree. We have to reroute our schedule to take classes. We are all
future soldiers and future leaders of our country who want to make a difference in the nation.

President Welsh stated one more time that the courses you need to graduate will be offered. Maybe not by your
favorite professor but they will be offered.

Ms. Paskiet stated that we don’t need our favorite professor we need physical proof to see that these classes will be
offered. I’m a junior and need to know that these classes are going to be offered.

Trustee Abraham asked Ms. Paskiet what makes you think these classes are not going to be offered? Is someone
telling you this?

Ms. Paskiet said she is not going to name anyone and throw anyone under the bus. We are just aware of the classes
not being offered every semester or every other year. These are the classes we need in the Biochemistry major to
get out degrees.

Trustee DeFranco asked if there is history of the number of students who are signed up for the courses? Can you
show proof that there are 15 students signed up for a lab and there are only 14 available seats to fill in the lab?

Trustee Klaus stated, “If you don’t get the courses you need to graduate, I will resign from the board.”
Trustee Lingenfelter stated that it was good to see the number of students at today’s meeting. 20 years ago when he was the student trustee he couldn’t get five students to come to the meetings. Trustee Lingenfelter said the only way this is going to get changed is if you get on your mobile devices and contact the Governor and the members of the General Assembly who appropriate your dollars. Thanks for coming but follow-up and tell them what you are saying here.

Johnathan Maichin, student studying chemistry and secondary education and his first year here as a transfer student and thanked the Trustees for the time and energy they put into the University. He stated he understands the issues with the state and aware that you can’t make everyone happy and we, the students are just here to make our voices heard. It is in the students’ best interest to have choices and understand that is part of what makes this a unique University. Essentially what he is suggesting is that the students would like to hear more of the details and make sure some of the choices that are important to us suites our learning styles. Appreciates there are talks to get the information out, he has heard the rumors and the information being put out is a struggle.

Zachary Craver, freshman student in the Nursing program stated he is not concerned about his classes, his concern is he works part time and in the next 3 years his tuition will increase over $5,000. How is that good for the students? It might be good for the University but not for the students.

Trustee Ross stated that he is not sure how this pilot program will affect the enrollment but it is something that we have to do. The money is not there and we are doing the best we can with the available funding.

Trustee Scavello stated that with the Governor’s $4.1 shortfall, $1 billion shortfalls in spending that the revenues did not come, add $650 million in pension obligations for state employees and teachers not properly funded over the past year. We are operating on an 08-09 budget because the state revenues are not what they are to be with $1.2 billion not funded in the past 4 years. When your revenue is down you have not easy choices to make. When you don’t have the revenue you have to raise taxes. I give my salary and scholarships to these students, over $250,000 to these students. No one in this state is fighting for these students more than me. We are in tough economic times. We need to raise personal income tax in the state. Any extra money we find is going to go to the students to help.

Trustee DeFranco stated that we are trying to make this affordable to you. We are your friends, not your enemies.

Trustee Abraham stated it is important to know, no one is volunteering for cuts. It’s not good for anyone

Trustee Scavello wanted to know before the vote, how do we compare to the nursing programs in other Universities? President Welsh responded that we are the lowest. We are giving a quality product at the right price.

Mr. Craver agreed that it is a great program for the price. He just doesn’t know if he can do it now with the increase.

Mike D’Imperio, a student asked why not sell this building (Innovation Center) to provide money. No communication is going on here. You are telling us its red, red, red and it’s not. We are saying we can’t see its red because we can’t see anything. We are only here for answers as to what is going on but also for answers to how we can help. There will only be six professors (chemistry dept.) to keep these classes going on. What is going to keep us here if we don’t have the classes we need to graduate?

Dr. Welsh stated that changes can improve the university; it doesn’t have to destroy the University. We are trying to get the schedule out as soon as we can.

Trustee Lee commented on the question of why we don’t sell this building which was a very good question. The whole perception is that this building is just something that we can just get rid of and use the money for our own use. He then asked VP Long to make a statement on the Innovation Center building.
VP Long shared the debt of this building that we have is $558,000. The vacant second floor was going to be used for additional classrooms but with the decline of enrollment that is not a good choice at this time. The University is looking at other opportunities to increase revenue to cut down on costs. Grant research, success generation revenue for students and better opportunities of the students. It takes an act of Legislature to sell a state owned property and it is a long process. We wouldn’t get what we owe for it and we would have an outstanding payment on it.

Danielle Dungee, student majoring in Chemistry stated there are only six professors in the Chemistry department. How do you expect them to support the students in the major?

Provost Reidhead stated we are facing the survival of our programs; program by program and the way we are doing it now, we can’t continue to do it the same way and survive. The good news is this, and what I said before is true, other Universities are dealing with the same thing including the larger ones like MIT. We are all dealing with how to slow down the rising cost of education at the same time providing the best education we can. We can do that in the Chemistry department, probably not as fast as we did but we can do it. There are still talks going on with the department chairs, VP Long is talking with the union leadership and we are trying to get to the best place possible. Let’s work together to solve this problem. Nursing, the sad reality, is choice between raising your tuition or cancelling the program. We do not like what you the students are going through. We don’t like what the President, Council of Trustees, or the faculty are going through. We need to work together for solutions. We do not want to lay something out today and end up changing it. Be patient with us. You are going to have the classes you need because we have to provide them.

Sarah Hennings, a sophomore Biochemistry major. She doesn’t have numbers or statistics but none of our questions are being answered honestly and the numbers are going in one ear and out the other. We would like to hear a plan that is being discussed. If we hear some sort of plan it is better than hearing nothing. She is here today missing work and also a Warrior Elite meeting and is not getting anything out of it.

Trustee Ross stated they are working on it. Everyone has to agree on the plan and then the faculty union has to agree on it. That is where it is. They will not present something until it is set in stone.

Ms. Hennings had a second question wanting to know if these decisions will make the classes bigger?

President Welsh responded that we don’t know at this point until the schedule is set. Some classes might be larger, some smaller, and some the same.

Trustee Lingenfelter interjected that class size is not used as a proxy for quality. Student learning outcomes are the important aspect.

Robert Cohen, Chair of Physics commented that he would like to make himself available to answer the questions that have been raised. Just wanted to let you know he is available to assist.

Nancy Van Arsdale, APSCUF President, confirmed there have been weekly productive meetings and wanted to thank the staff of the Stroud Courier for their weekly publication. She then asked why Physics, Chemistry, Counseling Services, and Music? Students have said they were asked if they have been manipulated to speak out. If you have evidence that we have manipulated ESU students show it to me. Trustees, many of you have been on the council for a number of years, you took strong stands in building the Science and Technology Center and now have to look at the importance of the future of STEM. You need to remove the retrenchments. You have heard how far we are down with retirements and in some cases deaths. When it is a critical STEM program we need to work together. One letter of retrenchment has been revoked. She also provided a report from the faculty (attached) and also provided documents to VP Long.
Victoria Paskiet returned for more comments. A student’s junior and senior year is crunch time. ESU has 25 cadets in the ROTC program, the highest ESU has ever had. 10 of those are freshmen and all have told her as their squad leader that they want to transfer. They are stressed that they will not get their classes needed to graduate.

Trustee Scavello mentioned he has received tremendous amounts of emails from students with concerns that they won’t get the classes needed to graduate. He is very confident students will get the classes needed to graduate.

Nick Cola, graduate student, went through the same thing when he was an undergrad. Spending too much money, declines in student enrollments. Start looking at the research programs, research brings in money, science research brings in money. If teachers and students start producing more research, why would increasing enrollment not happen? Why get rid of the professors when they are bringing in research?

President Welsh stated that grants fund only certain things and there might be a little funding leftover for the University but very little.

Cassandra Hehn, Biochemistry major, transferred from Penn State. Smaller class sizes make a difference. She sat in a 700 person class and didn’t like it. Getting rid of professors is nonsense but understands where it is coming from. Really loves this place and wants to stay here but you are making it hard.

Maria Kitchens-Kintz does not understand why sciences are being cut so drastically when the nation is moving to STEM. 5.9 million profit taken out of faculty budgets, 2.4 million in Biology alone. Why have we been really diminished over the past five years when science should be growing stronger and stronger. We are trying to hold on but we do have a breaking point.

Pat Haton, student had three choices, join the marines, go to Temple, or come here. He chose to come here because of the small classroom size. ROTC is very time consuming. Scheduling classes are very tough. If he goes into a 5th year he will have to pay everything back and enlist. Students and professors are on a first name basis and that is why he came to ESU.

Trustee Klaus stated he had been a faculty member and a union member here at ESU for over 30 years. In all his years he has never known of any faculty union more unwilling to work with the administration than the present one. We need to work together. It is proven that sports bring in more students to colleges. President Dillman lead the university into heavy debt and now President Welsh has been hired to clean-up. There has been a decline in enrollment of over 11%, what has the union done to help with recruiting students? Student enrollment and retention has been a problem to make University run on budget. We need to work together, bring more students to ESU and retain the students for graduation. Faculty members teach 12-15 hours per week and have office hours for five hours a week. Some faculty are putting 20 to fewer hours a week, at 30 weeks a year, $50-$112 thousand for 30 weeks of work plus workload, benefits, summer school, etc. We have to serve the students in a far better way. Fact, some union members make more than $200,000 with summer school and workload. I worked here for 30 years and I can tell you what goes on here.

Andi McClanahan, Chair of Communication Studies, wanted to respond quickly to Trustee Klaus’ comments, “If you were an associate professor here and only worked 20 hours a week, you were doing something wrong.”

Trustee Klaus stated he was teaching and coaching and put in 40 – 50 hours a week. There were other colleagues that only put in 12-15 hour weeks.

McClanahan then invited Trustee Klaus to come at 7:00 a.m. to her office and follow her around for a day and he will see she puts in far more than needed.

Trustee Ross stated, “as I said in the beginning, everyone wants to solve this problem and the only way to do so is to work together.”
12. An Executive Session was called at 6:24 p.m.

13. Meeting called back to order at 6:57 p.m.

14. **Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 7:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Amy S. Welch  
Council Secretary

Recording Secretary: Marcy L. Cetnar